





Is Policy Effective Enough?

An assessment of Ireland's national climate adaptation policies

HOST INSTITUTION





Even if we stop all Greenhouse emissions today, we have now locked in some degree of climate change, with associated shocks and impacts that we cannot avoid. Climate Adaptation is the process of preparing for those impacts, and increasing resilience in a way that brings multiple benefits for Ireland's communities, economy and nature.

In this summary for policy-makers and practitioners, the EPA-funded Transboundary Adaptation Learning Exchange (TALX) project team identifies the barriers and enablers of climate adaptation and assesses national policy against these, before highlighting specific areas where Ireland is neglecting to meet its policy ambitions, and where it must improve.

Key Messages

The TALX project has identified five key principles which are central to the development of good quality adaptation policy. Despite making progress in certain aspects, Ireland is not fully addressing any of them in current policy ambitions, in particular due to a lack of resource to drive implementation. Across all areas, policy has either failed to acknowledge essential criteria for adaptation or has not provided resource for implementation. Important messages in the Irish context, for each theme, are highlighted below:

- 1. Stakeholder engagement: Representative stakeholder engagement is a fundamental feature of good quality adaptation planning, especially for difficult decisions which require local buy-in. A few structures (such as public consultations) exist to support this work, but none currently enable the breadth and depth of engagement required.
- 2. Policy and Governance: Ireland has ambition to improve climate adaptation, with national climate adaptation policies, underpinned by legislation, and a monitoring and evaluation framework. However, governance structures often promote siloed working, and a lack of resources for cross-sector and multi-level collaboration mean that issues of justice and equity are not being adequately addressed. The lack of resource for implementation has also hindered the emergence of climate adaptation leaders and this has impacted on practise at local scales, which requires stakeholder input and support to be successful.
- 3. Resource: While Irish policy supports advances in both obtaining new evidence and communicating it to wider audiences, the scale of required staff resource and financing has not been acknowledged in policy. Doing nothing is the most expensive, and worst option. However, without clear government understanding and plans which acknowledge the scale of the financial cost of implementing adaptation measures, policy goals will never be reached and the adaptation gap will continue to grow.
- 4. Decision-making: Successful adaptation at all levels is underpinned by good decision-making, however, the skills, resources and guidance needed to assess and decide on adaptation options in an equitable manner is currently not provided for in national level policy. This has a knock on effect, and sets the standard for sub-national policy as well, increasing the likelihood of inequity and maladaptation in Ireland.
- 5. Mainstreaming: Policy acknowledges that adaptation should become part of the 'business-as-usual' but there is still a large adaptation gap in Ireland. For example, there is a major gap in both how adaptation is perceived by society, and a significant lack of sustainable adaptation initiatives currently being implemented across Ireland.

Recommendations

Critical principles to successful and effective climate adaptation have been outlined. We recommend policy-makers and practitioners should:

- Incentivise place-based adaptation partnerships¹ to move away from siloed working and promote cross-sector and multi-level collaboration. Placebased adaptation partnerships such as the Maharees Conservation Association, are an excellent tool that can bring a wide range of stakeholders together to address common risks and opportunities in their locality. By advertising and funding locally-led partnerships and initiatives, the government can support capacity building and encourage ownership of adaptation action among stakeholders.
- Adaptation needs to move beyond short-term project and political cycles. Ireland needs to begin developing long-term and self-sustaining adaptation initiatives. Policymaking can support a pipeline of adaptation projects that will have social and economic co-benefits affecting real and meaningful change in society.
- Establish opportunities for dialogue at both local and national scales with diverse stakeholders. Building on Ireland's National Dialogue on Climate Action, which focused largely on climate mitigation, government should develop innovative, fair and inclusive approaches to

ensure that stakeholder feedback is meaningfully integrated into subsequent adaptation policies and actions, to support systemic change.

- 4. Ensure transparent monitoring, evaluation and learning are embedded in adaptation activity at all levels, so that there is a process for continual improvement. Mandate and support the reporting of adaptation progress for all sectors and local authorities on regular cycles and promote and reward examples of practical and innovative climate action solutions that prioritise mitigation and adaptation co-benefits.
- 5. **Map climate impacts** alongside existing regional data such as health and inequity information to see where the highest vulnerabilities lie. Use these maps to aid decision-making and develop and prioritise adaptation solutions that will increase the resilience of the most vulnerable stakeholders and communities and reduce further inequity and injustice in society.
- Communicate and co-develop adaptation actions with those they are intended to benefit to increase support and avoid maladaptation². Engage with a wide range of local stakeholders throughout the adaptation process, ensuring understanding and ownership on initiatives.

Detailed Results

You can find a breakdown of the exact criteria used to assess National Adaptation Policy on the next page, listed under the 5 areas outlined in the 'key messages' section above. These criteria were arrived at after a comprehensive literature review of international good practice in climate adaptation, by the TALX project team and validated by an expert panel of practitioners and policy-makers, using the Delphi approach. More information on how the TALX team arrived at these conclusions and how some of these recommendations can be carried out is available on the TALX website where the TALX project has developed a framework to support place-based adaptation partnerships

¹ Place-based Adaptation Partnerships - formed from cross-sectoral and multi-level collaborations to support adaptation in a particular area ² Maladaptation – when climate adaptation actions have unintended negative consequences

Table 1: The criteria used to assess national climate adaptation policy (Blue: Acknowledged in policy with resources provided, Amber: Acknowledged in policy without resources provided, Red: Not acknowledged in policy)

Factor	Sub-factor		Criteria	Rating
r t	Stakeholder	S1	Representative stakeholder involvement throughout the entire climate adaptation process, from the	
Stakeholder Engagement	Engagement		creation of adaptation policy to the implementation and evaluation of adaptation plans	
		S2	A dedicated process in place to facilitate inclusive stakeholder involvement in the preparation of	
			adaptation policies	
Policy and Governance	National Policy	P1	A central administration body officially in charge of adaptation policy making	
	inational Folioy		A national climate adaptation policy	
			Country level legislation in place to underpin adaptation policy (including frameworks and strategies etc.)	
			Independent monitoring and evaluation of national policy	
	Leadership &		Horizontal (cross-sectoral) coordination mechanisms exist within the governance system, with division of	
	Co-ordination of		responsibilities and SMART objectives and the alignment of policies	
	Roles and	P6	Vertical (multi-level) coordination mechanisms exist within the governance system, enabling all levels of	
	Responsibilities		administration from local to national to influence policy making	
		Ρ7	Creation of spaces for leaders of climate adaptation to emerge across scales	
			Climate adaptation is scalable, able to be tailored to different levels	
		P9	Transparent climate finance with regards to adaptation initiatives	
			Transboundary cooperation (either existing or planned) to work together to address common challenges	
			with other countries	
	Climate Justice	P11	Domestic justice and equity issues (economic, social, environmental and cultural), relevant to each	
	and Equity		country, are recognised in national-level climate change policy and implementation (e.g. through decision-	
			making)	
		P12	Processes are in place to allow actions to reduce any identified differences and/or ensure the benefits of	
		_	interventions accrue to the most vulnerable	
		P13	Climate adaptation policy development, implementation and review is fully transparent	
Resource	Staff and	R1	Appropriate financing (enough to cover the cost of policy actions) is being applied to climate adaptation to	
	Financing		achieve policy goals at all levels of governance	
	0	R2	Accessible long-term and self-sustaining resources are available to support policy goals at increasing	
			climate resilience (i.e. funding, infrastructure, human resources)	
	Capacity	R3	Policy supports education, empowerment and engagement of stakeholders at all levels of decision making	
	Building and		and action taking in relation to adaptation	
	understanding	R4	Mechanisms exist to recruit and train practitioners with the specific skills required to undertake complex	
	the capability of		climate adaptation	
	decision-makers			
	and action			
	takers			
	Information and		The policy supports advances in scientific research to improve understanding and inform decision-making	
	Data		Guidance for how to employ climate adaptation information is provided at sub-national levels	
	Communication	R7	Communication and engagement strategies included within the policy that utilize multiple platforms in	
	and Guidance		order to reach diverse stakeholders	
		R8	Recognition within the policy that climate change is an international issue and that adaptation strategies	
			must look beyond national boundaries (i.e. the policy ensures the international aspect of adaptation is	
			considered at decision-making levels)	
		R9	Learning and support networks are available to enable all decision makers in producing and implementing	
			appropriate climate adaptation policies	
Decision- making	Decision-making	D1	Priority adaptation options are identified, prioritised and selected based on robust, equitable and	
			transparent methods (e.g. using decision support tools)	
			An evaluation process is in place to assess the effectiveness of actions taken across all aspects of climate	
			adaptation (i.e. from stakeholder engagement to mainstreaming)	
		D3	The policy recognises that adaptation is an iterative and flexible process that accounts for new	
			information/ experience	
Mainstreaming	Mainstreaming	M1	Consideration of climate change adaptation been included in the national frameworks for environmental	
			impact assessments and DRR's	
		M2	Key policies recognise the need for adaptation action in future growth and development as a result of the	
			impacts of climate change	
			National policy instruments promote adaptation at sectoral level, in line with national priorities	
		M4	Adaptation is mainstreamed in insurance or alternative policy instruments to provide incentives for	
			investments in risk prevention	
		M5	Climate mitigation and adaptation are being investigated in tandem	
		M6	Adaptation actions are sustainable (i.e. meet environmental, societal and cultural needs) for their intended lifetime	

Acknowledgements



This material is based upon works supported by the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) under Grant No. EPA-2019-CCRP-MS.61.

The views of the authors are their own and do not represent the views of the EPA.

The research of the TalX project was carried out by UCC in the MaREI Centre as part of the Environmental Research Institute, with partners in SNIFFER (Scotland) and Climate NI (Northern Ireland). The authors are particularly grateful to all the research participants who took part in the Delphi Panel, for their valuable insights, time, enthusiasm and commitment.



Contact Details

Denise McCullagh: <u>denise.mccullagh@ucc.ie</u> Stephen Jones: <u>stephenjones@climatenorthernireland.org.uk</u>



